

Debating national identity in postcolonial cities: A comparison of civic education textbooks in Hong Kong and Macau

Licheng Qian¹ | Meng U leong² 

¹Department of Criminology and Sociology, Birmingham City University, Birmingham, UK

²Department of Government and Public Administration, University of Macau, Macau, China

Correspondence

Meng U. leong, Department of Government and Public Administration, University of Macau, Room 4049, Humanities and Social Sciences Building (E21), Avenida da Universidade, Taipa, Macau, China.
Email: leonieong@um.edu.mo

Funding information

Start-Up Research Grant of the University of Macau, Grant/Award Number: SRG2022-00001-FSS

Abstract

Civic education has long been viewed as a political tool to construct identity in nation-states. This view, however, is complicated by the cases of Hong Kong and Macau. As former colonies and current autonomous regions of China, the two cities went through decolonisation without becoming nation-states. Does this status affect Hong Kong's and Macau's identity discourses? Are civic textbooks tools to construct or deconstruct a Chinese/national identity? What explains the two cities' different identity discourses? Going beyond the civic-ethnic binary, this article argues that identities in 'postcolonial territorial autonomies', such as Hong Kong and Macau, should be analysed through a multilevel framework of identity/state-society interactions, reflecting the local, national and global forces at play. The interactions of these forces shape Hong Kong's layered identity, Macau's ambiguous identity and the two cities' contradictory attitudes towards colonial legacies. This study contributes to a relational and interactional rethinking of national identity and decolonisation.

KEYWORDS

civic education, decolonisation, Hong Kong, Macau, national identity

1 | INTRODUCTION

Civic education, sometimes framed as liberal or moral education, has long been viewed as a political tool to construct national identity. This function of civic education has been well documented and analysed in both mature and newly born nation-states (Dinc, 2020; Guichard, 2013; Trošt, 2018) and democratic and authoritarian regimes (Lu, 2017; Ram, 2000; Washington et al., 2011).

Despite its seemingly universal identity-making function, the use of civic education in promoting nationalism, particularly the ethnic or 'pseudo-biological' (Naftali, 2021)¹ kind of nationhood, is especially evident in China's 'patriotic education' projects (Wang, 2014; Zhao, 1998). While the effects and reception of China's 'patriotic education' might vary among different populations (Naftali, 2021; Qian et al., 2017; Tang & Darr, 2012), and popular nationalism can backfire (Gries, 2005), the Chinese state's determination to produce loyal national subjects through the use of textbooks seems firm and absolute.

The wisdom on civic education in general and China's 'patriotic education' in particular have recently been complicated, if not challenged, by the cases of Hong Kong and Macau. This complication arises from three aspects. First, as former British and Portuguese colonies and current Special Administrative Regions (SARs) of China, Hong Kong and Macau went through decolonisation without becoming independent nation-states. Does this status affect Hong Kong's and Macau's strategies for producing civic textbooks? As a new political/regime category, which we call 'postcolonial territorial autonomy', would Hong Kong or Macau use civic textbooks differently than nation-states?

Second, as SARs of China, Hong Kong and Macau belong to China but differ from other Chinese provinces. Against this background, do China's 'patriotic education' strategies and discourse apply to Hong Kong and Macau? Does 'securitisation' of education (Vickers & Morris, 2022), modelling the mainland practice, affect identity discourses in Hong Kong's and Macau's civic textbooks?

Third, while both Hong Kong and Macau have civic education, although with different names, Macau's education has long been viewed as successful in making 'patriotic' citizens, whereas Hong Kong's civic education was viewed by many as the causes of 'radicalised youth' and 'riots'² during the 2014 umbrella movement and the 2019 anti-extradition movement. Do Hong Kong and Macau, both as SAR regimes and postcolonial cities, treat civic education differently, and why?

Based on the analysis of the Hong Kong and Macau civic textbooks, curriculum guidelines, government reports and archives, and speeches by political figures, this paper argues that identity discourse in postcolonial 'territorial autonomies' (Fong & Ichijo, 2022), such as Hong Kong and Macau, should be analysed through a *multilevel framework of identity/state-society interactions*, which contains the local, national and global dimensions and goes beyond the ethnic-civic binary. Using this framework, the paper finds that while the Hong Kong Liberal Studies textbooks adopt a *layered* identity discourse reflecting the local-national-global facets, the Macau textbooks disclose a rather *ambiguous* identity discourse. Compared with Hong Kong, the Macau textbooks attach more ethnic elements to national/Chinese identity but, surprisingly, contain much more favourable narratives on the colonial/Portuguese legacy.

By examining the textbook production process, this paper further argues that Hong Kong's and Macau's contrasting identity discourses are the results of different state-society interactions operating at multiple levels, namely, the local state-civil society interaction mode dominant in Hong Kong and the local state-central state interaction mode dominant in Macau.

This paper contributes to the study of civic education and Chinese/national identity by debunking two contradictory but interrelated myths that either over-emphasise civic textbooks' 'patriotic education' function or underline textbooks' role in 'radicalising' youths.³ More importantly, by proposing a multilevel framework of identities/state-society interactions, this study discloses the textbook/identity *production* process and contributes to a *relational and interactional* rethinking of national identity and decolonisation.

In what follows, this paper will first introduce the histories and theoretical representativeness of Hong Kong and Macau, based on which the 'multilevel' framework will be introduced. Utilising this framework, this paper will conduct a detailed analysis of the civic textbooks in Hong Kong and Macau and explain the two cities' different identity-making strategies as manifested in the textbooks.

2 | WHY HONG KONG AND MACAU?

Hong Kong and Macau are currently SARs of China, but they both have a colonial past. In 1841, China, the then-Qing dynasty, lost the First Opium War to the British Empire, thus beginning the era of ‘one hundred years of humiliation’ (Wang, 2014). Consequently, Hong Kong Island was ceded to Great Britain ‘in perpetuity’ under the Treaty of Nanking (Carroll, 2007, p. 1) in 1842; the Kowloon Peninsula, another part of Hong Kong, was ceded in 1860 under the Convention of Peking; and the New Territories, the third major constituent area of Hong Kong, was leased to Britain for 99 years in 1898 (Carroll, 2007, p. 1). Following the communist revolution, China had opportunities to retake Hong Kong in and after 1949, but these opportunities were given up (Carroll, 2007, pp. 135–138; Hook & Neves, 2002). It was only after 1984, when the Sino-British Joint Declaration was signed, that the British promised to return Hong Kong to China, effective on 1 July 1997. Under this agreement, Hong Kong became a SAR of China, which belongs to China but embraces a ‘high degree of autonomy’.

Macau, the city adjacent to Hong Kong, had undergone a similar transition. In 1887, the Ming dynasty and Portugal signed the Luso-Chinese Treaty of Friendship and Trade, which gave the Portuguese a ‘perpetual occupation and government of Macau’ (Hao, 2011, p. 42). In 1975, shortly after the Carnation Revolution, the Portuguese offered to return Macau, but China ‘declined to accept the “retrocession”’ (Hook & Neves, 2002) for political and economic considerations (Clayton, 2009; Pina-Cabral, 2002, p. 5). Since then, however, Portugal had largely given up ‘sovereignty over Macau and retained only the right to manage it’ (Hao, 2011, p. 31). In 1987, China and Portugal signed the Sino-Portuguese Joint Declaration, which finally confirmed the return of Macau to China on 20 December 1999. Similar to Hong Kong after 1997, Macau did not become an independent nation-state; instead, the city became a SAR of China with a ‘high degree of autonomy’ under the design of ‘one country, two systems’.

Hong Kong’s and Macau’s status after decolonisation represents a new political category for studying national identity, which we call ‘postcolonial territorial autonomy’. The term ‘territorial autonomy’ refers to ‘a territorial political entity within a sovereign state, which exercises asymmetrical self-governing competences’ (Ichijo, 2022). Borrowing wisdom from this definition, we argue that Hong Kong and Macau represent a ‘postcolonial’ type⁴ of ‘territorial autonomies’, which experiences decolonisation and enjoys self-governance but without becoming an independent nation-state (thus still within a sovereign state). How to deal with identities in relation to the old and new ‘masters’ thus becomes a thorny problem for this type of political regime.

While Hong Kong and Macau have the same legal status as SAR, the two cities certainly have different feelings towards China. Compared with Hong Kong, ‘the bad child’, Macau was usually viewed as China’s patriotic ‘good child’ (Ieong, 2017, 2019). In December 2019, when Hong Kong was in the middle of the anti-extradition movement, Macau was ‘stable’, celebrating the 20th anniversary of its return to China. One of the reasons why Hong Kong is not ‘patriotic’ enough, many believe, is the lack of ‘decolonisation’ in textbooks.⁵ Is civic education the reason that explains Macau’s ‘patriotism’ and Hong Kong’s rebelliousness? Are civic textbooks tools to construct or deconstruct national identity? To unravel these questions, a comparative study of the civic textbooks (and their production processes) in Hong Kong and Macau becomes crucial.

3 | BEYOND THE CIVIC-ETHNIC BINARY: A MULTILEVEL FRAMEWORK

The debates over identities in Hong Kong and Macau are centred on the formats of national and local identities in the two cities. While there are multiple ways to construct identities, the civic and ethnic types are the two most cited formats (see Reeskens & Hooghe, 2010), although they are often referred to by different names. For instance, when studying nationhood in France and Germany, Rogers Brubaker (1990, 1992) argues that the French model embodies a ‘state-centred’, ‘assimilationist’ or ‘*jus soli*’ understanding of nationhood, while the German model stands for an ‘ethnocultural’, ‘differentialist’ or ‘*jus sanguinis*’ understanding of nationhood (Brubaker, 1992, p. 1). Echoing Brubaker’s arguments, Anthony Smith has also differentiated two types of nationhood, the ‘Western model’

emphasising territory, common system of laws, legal quality of citizens and civic culture, and the 'Eastern model' emphasising ethnic descent and cultural ties (Smith, 1992).

There are at least three caveats regarding the civic–ethnic differentiation of identities. First, while the civic and ethnic principles include objective criteria for defining nationhood and citizenship, such as the legal procedure in the civic model, they also involve a subjective dimension. For instance, the cultural ties and feelings of racial communities in the ethnic model are essentially subjective, while the 'civic culture' is also indispensable in 'binding the citizens together' (Smith, 1992) in the civic model. Second, while the civic–ethnic divide seems clear-cut, in reality, a particular identity might have both elements. For instance, as Smith (1992) points out, 'we find elements of both at various times in several nationalisms in both Eastern and Western Europe'. Third, and more importantly, civic–ethnic differentiation has its limits in studying identities in 'postcolonial territorial autonomies', such as Hong Kong and Macau, which embody multiple levels of identities. While the local and global levels of identity also contain civic or ethnic elements, the civic–ethnic binary is more useful to study national identity. As our research will show, some levels of identities in these autonomies can hardly be analysed by either the civic or the ethnic dimension.

Going beyond the civic–ethnic binary, and building upon the literature on Hong Kong identities (Jackson, 2019; Kan, 2010; Morris & Vickers, 2015; Ou & Sandel, 2021; Vickers & Kan, 2003; Vickers & Morris, 2022), particularly the 'colonial–Chinese–global nexus' (Ku, 2018), this paper argues that *a framework of multilevel identities* is more useful for studying identities in postcolonial cities, or what we call 'postcolonial territorial autonomies'. Corresponding to these autonomies' decolonisation paths, the multilevel framework contains three identity levels: the local identity, speaking to the indigenous societies; the national identity, connecting to Chinese identity; and the global/imperial identity, dealing with the two cities' relationship to the former coloniser and the larger world society. While some identity levels cannot be analysed by the civic–ethnic binary, the multilevel framework will dialogue with this binary,⁶ particularly to test the assumption about the Chinese state's heavy reliance on the ethnic dimension of national identity.

In addition to the analysis of identity discourse, the multilevel framework also explains the *production* process of the textbook discourse. Extending the classic state–society paradigm in China studies (see Perry, 1994), our *framework on multilevel state–society interactions* views textbook/discourse production as the result of a series of interactions between the central state, the local state and the local society. For instance, as our research will show, the civic textbooks in Hong Kong reflect a consensus on social issues between the Hong Kong government and local civil society, while the policy agenda of the central state strongly affects the textbook production in Macau.

Proposing a framework differentiating the local, national and global/imperial identities, however, does not mean endorsing an essentialist understanding of these three identity dimensions and their relations. As Krishan Kumar argues, national identity and nationalism can also be 'imperial' (Kumar, 2003). By the same token, symbols, icons and meanings attached to a particular identity dimension can also be transformed and incorporated by other types of identity, which is perfectly illustrated by Macau's adoption of Portuguese/colonial legacies. Therefore, what lies at the heart of the multilevel framework is not just a three-dimensional identity model but the very relation or interaction of these dimensions at local, national and global/imperial levels.

4 | DATA AND METHODS

The major empirical data of this research are civic textbooks in Hong Kong and Macau. Civic education in Hong Kong is also known as Liberal Studies, which 'is one of the core subjects in the three-year senior secondary curriculum'⁷ as well as a subject for Hong Kong's university entrance exam (known as the Diploma of Secondary Education [DSE] exam). This Liberal Studies curriculum includes six modules, including *Personal Development & Interpersonal Relationships*, *Hong Kong Today*, *Modern China*, *Globalisation*, *Public Health* and *Energy Technology & the Environment*. The most relevant module for this study is *Hong Kong Today*, because this module directly discusses identity issues in Hong Kong. This module is also the most debated and controversial subject in Hong Kong's recent social movements.

There are multiple versions of civic textbooks in Hong Kong, which are mainly published by six commercial publishing houses in Hong Kong and sanctioned by Hong Kong's education bureau. These publishing houses include the Ming Pao Education Publications Limited, Hong Kong Educational Publishing Company (HKEP), Times Publishing, Modern Educational Research Society, Aristo Educational Press and Ling Kee Publishing Group. Among these textbooks, the ones published by Aristo and HKEP are the most frequently used in Hong Kong's secondary schools.⁸ The Aristo textbook was particularly singled out and criticised during the movements in Hong Kong.⁹ Therefore, while we have collected five versions of textbooks from the six publishing houses, we will mainly use the Aristo and HKEP textbooks as the primary samples and the remaining versions as secondary sources.

Starting from the school year 2021/2022, the Hong Kong authority has renamed Liberal Studies as Citizenship and Social Development (CSD) to handle the 'ongoing controversy over Liberal Studies in society' (CDC & HKEAA, 2021, p. 3). Compared with the old Liberal Studies textbooks, the political constraint on the newly produced CSD textbooks is more direct and evident. Under the new guideline, the CSD textbooks are now required to go through official screening, and contents viewed as politically sensitive are substantially reduced or deleted.¹⁰ However, since one aim of this study is to test the accusation that civic textbooks 'radicalise youth' during Hong Kong's social movements, we particularly picked the second-hand textbooks used before or during the 2019 movement, namely, the Aristo textbooks published in 2016 and the HKEP textbooks published in 2017.

Civic education in Macau, known as the education of 'Morality and Citizenship', only became a compulsory subject in 2009. For a very long time, since the colonial era, Macau has had a rather fragmented and autonomous education system and lacks a unified curriculum (Bray, 1992). Schools also have autonomy and discretion in choosing their own textbooks, usually importing textbooks from Hong Kong and Taiwan. Only after 2002, when Macau opened its gambling market, did the SAR government have the money and resources to afford a large expenditure on education (Zhou & Lam, 2022). In 2018, the Macau government finally published its official civic education textbook series entitled 'Morality and Citizenship', which was co-designed and co-published by the Education and Youth Development Bureau of Macau and China's People's Education Press (PEP). We collected all six volumes of *Morality and Citizenship* (used in middle and high schools) as our primary data for examining civic education in Macau (Figure 1).

In addition to the textbooks, we also collected materials reflecting the textbook production process, such as the education bureaus' curriculum guidelines, news reports, government documents, and speeches and comments from political figures. Analysing these data and textbooks together discloses a comprehensive picture of the 'politics of textbooks', speaking to both the textbook narratives and the production process behind.



FIGURE 1 Civic education textbooks (samples) in Hong Kong and Macau. [Colour figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

5 | MULTILEVEL IDENTITIES IN TEXTBOOKS: LOCAL, NATIONAL AND GLOBAL

As analysed by previous theoretical discussion, Hong Kong and Macau, as postcolonial territorial autonomies, must confront the identity problem at local, national and global/imperial levels. This section will examine Hong Kong and Macau's similarities and differences in constructing these levels of identities, testing whether an ethnic-centred Chinese identity has been applied to Hong Kong and Macau.

5.1 | Local identity: Combination of the civic and the ethnic

While the indigenous societies in Hong Kong and Macau have many different characteristics, the textbooks in the two cities share common features in discussing local identity, namely, the combination of civic and ethnic contents and the emphasis on both legal procedure and cultural ties. For instance, in the Aristo version of *Hong Kong Today* (Ng et al., 2016), there is one section particularly discussing the meaning of being 'Hong Kong residents' (Chapter 3, Section 2). This section argues that both Chinese and non-Chinese nationals can become permanent residents of Hong Kong as long as they follow the legal procedure defined by the Basic Law. Using the data on Hong Kong's Population by Nationality, the textbook further illustrates that Hong Kong residents are composed of people from different nationalities, such as Indonesia, the Philippines, the UK, India, Pakistan, the United States and Australia, among others. In addition to the civic aspect, Chapter 3 of *Hong Kong Today* also discusses the ethnic/cultural dimension of the local identity. For instance, the textbook differentiates 'Hong Kong residents' from 'Hong Kongers', acknowledging the differences between the objective and subjective dimensions of identity. On Page 221 of the Aristo version (Ng et al., 2016), the textbook cites the song 'Below the Lion Rock' and argues that popular culture strongly affects the feeling of community among 'Hong Kongers' [Xianggangren].

Similar to the Hong Kong textbooks, the Macau textbooks cover both civic and ethnic identity elements. For instance, in the first volume of *Morality and Citizenship* (PEP, 2019a), there is one section called 'identification', which is discussed in relation to the larger theme of the chapter: human rights and responsibility. This section on identity argues that 'due to the special historical background of Macau, the residents of Macau constitute a pluralistic identity legally, by blood and culture, such as "Chinese" [Zhongguoren] and "Macanese" [Tusheng Puren]¹¹' (PEP, 2019a, p. 62). In the second volume of *Morality and Citizenship* (PEP, 2019b), the textbook specifically introduces 'one country, two systems' and the legal rights of the Macau permanent residents under the Basic Law, particularly the rights to vote and to be elected (Lesson 7; p. 39). In addition to the civic aspect, Macau's textbooks describe a variety of ethnic and cultural activities, such as the Feast of Drunken Dragon, the belief in Na Tcha, the locally made herbal tea and many other examples of 'intangible cultural heritage'.

Despite the similarities, the Macau textbook differs from the Hong Kong textbook in its ambiguous layout of identity issues, lacking specific chapters devoted to the topic of identity. For example, each of the six volumes of *Morality and Citizenship* consists of nine chapters. These chapters usually begin with the issue of 'self', proceeding to the topic of family and school life, followed by socio-economic life in Macau and the introduction of China, and ending with the discussion of global affairs. In all six volumes, however, there is only one section called 'identification' (Lesson 12 of PEP, 2019a), directly touching upon the topic of Macau residents' everyday identities. In contrast, in *Hong Kong Today*, almost one-third of the textbook is devoted to the issue of identity, clearly laying out Hong Kong residents' local, national and global identities.

5.2 | National identity: Events and the civic-ethnic relationship

While civic and ethnic elements are covered in both Hong Kong and Macau textbooks, the two cities' national identity narratives differ in their uses of civic and ethnic contents. Specifically, the Hong Kong Liberal Studies textbooks

have adopted an 'eventful' approach, emphasising the influences of specific historical events on national identity; many of these events cannot be interpreted as either a civic or an ethnic type. In contrast, Macau textbooks are more traditional and rely more on the ethnic dimension.

Hong Kong's 'eventful' approach is evident in its explanation of 'historical, political, social, and cultural factors' (see the Aristo textbook by Ng et al., 2016), influencing national identity in the city. For instance, the textbook discusses the event of the 1997 handover and the case of Liu Xiaobo as examples of 'historical-political factors' and the 2008 Sichuan earthquake and the Beijing Olympics as examples of 'social-cultural factors'. In addition to these examples, the Hong Kong textbook also includes a graph in the text (Ng et al., 2016, p. 219), which systematically summarises significant events in the city. These identity-shaping events include the cession of Hong Kong to Great Britain in 1842, the founding of the People's Republic of China in 1949, the 1967 riot, the 'June 4 incident [*Liu Si Shijian*]' (see Ng et al., 2016, p. 219)¹² in 1989, Hong Kong's return to China in 1997, the SARS pandemic and the July 1 protest in 2003, and the launch of the Shenzhou XII manned spacecraft in 2008. Many of these events, such as the 1967 riot and the SARS pandemic, have such complicated implications that they can hardly be categorised as either 'civic' or 'ethnic' events.

The same eventful narrative is also evident in the HKEP textbook. As another major civic textbook in Hong Kong, the HKEP textbook has addressed a series of 'national events that make Hong Kong people proud' in Chapter 3, such as the Belt and Road Initiative, the Beijing Olympics and the Shanghai Expo, China's aerospace achievements, and Tu Youyou's winning of Nobel Prize in Medicine (Hung et al., 2017, p. 180). To be fair, the HKEP textbook also cites events adversely affecting Hong Kong people's identification with the state, such as the 'June 4 incident [*Liu Si Shijian*]' (see Hung et al., 2017, p. 180) in 1989 and the melamine-tainted milk powder event. In this sense, both the Aristo and HKEP textbooks emphasise the influence of events on national identity in Hong Kong, going beyond a single civic or ethnic interpretation.

Admittedly, as complements to the eventful narrative on national identity, civic and ethnic discourses are still used in the Hong Kong textbook. For instance, in Chapter 3 of *Hong Kong Today*, the textbook states: 'Chinese citizens [*Zhongguo Gongmin*] and "Chinese" [*Zhongguoren*] are both national-level identities, but there are conceptual differences. Chinese citizens are defined according to the Chinese Constitution, while "Chinese" can be defined at various levels, such as blood, race, and culture' (Ng et al., 2016, p. 211). Following this logic, the textbook discusses how, according to laws, residents in Hong Kong with foreign or non-Chinese ethnic origins can be legally regarded as Hong Kong residents but not as Chinese citizens. In discussing the ethnic aspects of national identity, the textbook argues: 'Prior to the handover in 1997, Hong Kong residents did not have the legal status of Chinese citizens but considered themselves Chinese because they shared the same ethnic origin and inherited the same traditional customs and culture as "Chinese"' (Ng et al., 2016, p. 212); in the meantime, the textbook does not avoid controversial issues in today's Hong Kong and acknowledges the recent conflict between Hong Kong and the Chinese mainland, noting that some Hong Kong residents are 'being criticised for lack of national identity' (Ng et al., 2016, p. 212), speaking to the civic-ethnic divide on local and national identities.

Unlike the Hong Kong case, Macau's textbooks are more traditional in discussing national identity, emphasising ethnic elements more without using an 'eventful' narrative. For instance, in Lesson 12 of the first volume of *Morality and Citizenship*, the only section discussing identities, the textbook states:

Our identity is reflected in how we respond to and feel about our local and national symbols. The important symbols of a country or a place, such as the national flag, the national emblem, the national anthem or the regional flag and emblem, represent the dignity of China and Macau. Our reactions and feelings towards our country, local historical events and culture can also reflect the identity of Macau residents as Chinese (*Zhongguoren*). (PEP, 2019a, p. 63)

An analysis of Macau textbooks' discussion of China further discloses Macau's emphasis on the ethnic dimension of national identity. Table 1 categorises the contents of Chapter 8 in each of the six volumes of *Morality and Citizenship*—Chapter 8 is always used to introduce China in the Macau textbooks.

Among the 15 sections/lessons, three discuss the civic and ethnic dimensions; five refer to the civic dimension; and seven are devoted to the ethnic/cultural dimension. More importantly, the discussion relating to the issue of national identity is more likely to be covered in the 'ethnic' sections. For instance, the concepts of the Chinese nation (PEP, 2019a) and Chinese culture (PEP, 2019d, 2019e) are particularly discussed through an ethnic dimension, while those topics less related to identity, such as China's diplomacy (PEP, 2019f) and economic system (PEP, 2019b), are covered through civic perspectives. The Macau textbook also directly introduces the concept of the 'Chinese nation' [*Zhonghua Minzu*], saying that all ethnic groups' cultures are the constituent parts of Chinese [*Zhongguo*] culture (PEP, 2019a, p. 125).

In addition to its emphasis on the ethnic dimension, another feature of the Macau textbook is its ambiguity towards the local–national–colonial relationship. On the one hand, the Macau textbook acknowledges the differences between Macau and China. This is illustrated through a survey included in the textbook, which asks to what extent a reader would identify himself/herself as a Macau resident [*Aomen Jumin*] or a Chinese [*Zhongguoren*] (PEP, 2019a, p. 62). The textbook also problematises the Portuguese identity through a comic illustration (Figure 2), asking if one, as a Macau/Chinese resident, should cheer for the Portuguese soccer team. As Figure 2 indicates, both the man on the left and the boy in the middle feel sorry about Portugal losing the soccer game. The boy says: 'I received Portuguese education and studied Portuguese history since childhood; although I only visited Portugal once, I quite like Portugal.' Echoing the boy, the man cannot help but shouts: 'Portugal loses. What a pity.' In contrast to these two figures, the boy on the right seems detached, saying: 'It is not China's game. I don't really care.' The different reactions depicted in this cartoon perfectly illustrate an ambiguous Chinese/Portuguese/local identity in Macau. On the other hand, the Macau textbook also cites stories of Macau residents cheering for Team China and constantly uses terms such as 'we' and 'our country'. As Chuyue Ou and Todd Sandel point out, 'linguistic deixis, such as the terms "we," "them," "this," and "here," are key words that reproduce banal nationalism' (Ou & Sandel, 2021). The different and sometimes contradictory uses of these terms, including the simultaneous uses of 'Macau' and 'China', thus disclose the very ambiguity regarding the issue of national identity in Macau.

TABLE 1 The content analysis of Chapter 8 (on China) in Macau textbooks.

Volume	Content/outlines/sections	Civic or ethnic dominant
PEP, 2019a (Middle School Grade 1)	(1) Our country (e.g., National Flag, Chinese identity, CCP and PRC) (2) Lovely rivers and mountains and splendid culture (3) Multiethnic country	(1) Civic + ethnic (2) Ethnic (3) Ethnic
PEP, 2019b (Middle School Grade 2)	(1) China's political system (2) China's economy (3) The meaning of reform and opening up	(1) Civic (2) Civic (3) Civic
PEP, 2019c (Middle School Grade 3)	(1) China's development (2) Traditional culture and values (3) Revival and export of excellent traditions	(1) Civic (2) Ethnic (3) Ethnic
PEP, 2019d (High School Grade 1)	(1) The influence of Chinese culture on the world (2) The impact of overseas Chinese on the world	(1) Ethnic (2) Ethnic
PEP, 2019e (High School Grade 2)	(1) Ancient philosophers' thinking (2) Achievements and dreams	(1) Ethnic (2) Civic + ethnic
PEP, 2019f (High School Grade 3)	(1) Diplomacy and peaceful development (2) Reflections on history and the maintenance of world peace	(1) Civic (2) Civic + ethnic



FIGURE 2 Comic illustration: Should one cheer for Team Portugal? Source: PEP (2019a, p. 62). [Colour figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

5.3 | Global identity: Facing the imperial/colonial legacy

Although some political observers criticise Hong Kong for its colonial nostalgia or the lack of sufficient ‘decolonisation’, our textbook analysis reveals a somewhat contradictory picture. Compared with Hong Kong’s avoidance of the colonial topic, the Macau textbook wholeheartedly embraces its colonial/Portuguese legacy. On the other hand, unlike the Hong Kong textbook, which has an elaborated concept of ‘world citizen’, the Macau textbook, once again, holds an ambiguous attitude towards global identity.

Before proceeding, it is necessary to clarify the analytical angle towards these global levels of identity. While the civic dimension of nationhood (for the UK and Portugal) applies to the pre-handover Hong Kong and Macau residents, the ethnic dimension is seldom evoked when discussing colonial identity in both the pre- and post-handover periods. For instance, as the Macau textbook points out, Macau residents with Portuguese citizenship before 1999 can continue to use their Portuguese passports (PEP, 2019a, p. 63), but they would be regarded as Chinese citizens if living in Macau. The Hong Kong residents can also use their British National Overseas (BNO) passports as travel documents after 1997, but they are not regarded as British citizens. In the meantime, due to the apparent physical differences between the Hong Kong/Macau residents and the British/Portuguese people, the ethnic dimension can hardly serve as a basis for ‘colonial identity’. Following the handover to China in 1997 and 1999, the Hong Kong and Macau residents thus lost both civic and ethnic bases to claim a British or Portuguese identity. For these reasons, this section will go beyond the traditional civic/ethnic analysis and focus instead on the textbooks’ specific attitudes (e.g., positive or negative) towards the former colonisers and the larger world society.

The Hong Kong textbooks’ narrative of the city’s British/colonial legacy is drastically different from what many would expect. In contrast to the ‘colonial nostalgia’ argument, the topic of the UK or British legacy is clearly avoided, if not criticised, in the Liberal Studies textbook. For instance, in *Hong Kong Today*, there are only three paragraphs discussing the British colonial legacy. On Page 220 of the *Aristo* textbook (Ng et al., 2016), the textbook states:

In the late 1960s, the British Hong Kong government actively implemented a number of policies to improve people’s livelihood, such as the nine-year free education and the ten-year housing construction plan, to enhance the sense of belonging to the locality at that time and to avoid Hong Kong people’s ‘non-Chinese non-British’ identity problem.

However, the textbook also criticises the UK, which is illustrated by the comment on Page 224:

Before the reunification, the British Hong Kong government deliberately carried out the process of 'removing the sense of national identity' and seldom talked about China's modern development in the primary and secondary school curricula, so students lacked knowledge of modern China, which made them feel combative about their identity as 'Chinese'.

This comment is followed by the textbook's discussion of how the Hong Kong SAR government promotes national education, which helps to strengthen Hong Kong students' 'pride in the country' (Ng et al., 2016, p. 224). The third paragraph on Page 240 is part of an exercise that repeats the second paragraph's ideas, criticising the UK's adverse impacts on Hong Kong people's Chinese identity. Except for one or two irrelevant sentences mentioning the UK, these three paragraphs are all the space that this textbook uses to discuss the British Empire. Evaluating these comments, one may find that the Hong Kong textbook definitely does not promote a British identity; its discussion of the UK is objective in its tone, acknowledging and even criticising the diverse impacts of the colonial power.

In contrast, the Macau textbooks do not avoid talking about Portugal; instead, they convey a very positive attitude towards Portugal and its colonial legacy. Portugal or Portuguese heritage is mentioned in each of the six volumes of *Morality and Citizenship*, mostly in a favourable tone. For instance, the first volume (PEP, 2019a) introduces the Forum for Economic and Trade Co-operation between China and Portuguese-speaking Countries (aka. Forum Macao), Macanese Cuisine, Vasco da Gama and the history of the Portuguese entering Macau. On Page 63, the textbook states:

As early as the beginning of the 16th century, the Portuguese began to come to the southeastern coast of China in 1553. The Portuguese came to Macau, bringing with them Western scientific and cultural knowledge, which had a major impact on China's astronomy, geography, calendar, medicine, architecture, etc. The Chinese culture also spreads to Europe through Macau, making Macau a centre of cultural exchange between China and the West. (p. 140)

Adopting the same positive tone, the second volume (PEP, 2019b) discusses the Macanese population in Macau, the Portuguese poet Luís Vaz de Camões, his stories in Macau, Portuguese architecture and the Forum Macao. That for the third graders has a more detailed introduction to the history of Portuguese rule, including the assassination of Joao Ferreira do Amaral (the then governor of Macau), how Macau was ceded to Portugal and the 123 incident in 1966 (PEP, 2019c). While the stories of Amaral and his colonial rule are negative (the only negative description of the Portuguese in the textbook series), this negative narrative quickly shifts to a positive follow-up discussion entitled 'from conflicts to cooperation' (PEP, 2019c, p. 102). In addition to these stories, the volumes for high school students all positively describe Portugal and its colonial legacy, covering issues such as economic co-operation (PEP, 2019d); Portugal-related sports, carnivals, festivals, food and trades (PEP, 2019e); and the Portuguese poet Luís Vaz de Camões and his stories in Macau (PEP, 2019f).

Colonial legacy aside, the Hong Kong and Macau textbooks also differ in their relations to the larger world society. While Hong Kong, as an international city, has a clearly elaborated concept of a 'world citizen', the Macau textbook does not introduce a similar identity. On Page 212 of *Hong Kong Today* (Ng et al., 2016), the textbook states: 'World citizenship is an identity derived in response to the trend of globalisation, based primarily on an individual's interest in world affairs, as opposed to the citizenship of sovereign nations defined by law and geography.' In addition to the introduction of the concept, the Hong Kong textbook also discusses how one can contribute to the world as a 'world citizen', citing international nongovernmental organisations and climate change as examples. In contrast to the Hong Kong case, while the Macau textbook also discusses global issues, such as globalisation (PEP, 2019d, 2019e, 2019f) and international organisations (PEP, 2019b), these discussions are rarely framed through the lens of a 'world citizen' or a 'global identity'. Therefore, while Hong Kong and Macau are both 'bridges' between the East

and the West, the civic textbooks in the two cities have surprisingly contrasting narratives on colonial legacy and global identity.

5.4 | Hong Kong and Macau textbooks: Layered vs. ambiguous identities

By comparing the Hong Kong and Macau textbooks, we can now summarise each city's unique approach to identity in its civic textbooks. Despite similarities, particularly the coexistence of civic and ethnic elements, the Hong Kong textbook discloses a 'layered identity', clearly differentiating the local, national and global dimensions. In contrast, the Macau textbook illustrates an 'ambiguous identity', which does not clearly distinguish the local–national–global boundary but embraces the city's colonial/Portuguese legacy (Table 2).

Specifically, as Table 2 illustrates, both the Hong Kong and Macau textbooks cover civic and ethnic elements when discussing local identity. For national/Chinese identity, however, the Macau textbooks utilise more ethnic elements, while the Hong Kong textbooks emphasise historical events and their influences, which can hardly be categorised as either civic or ethnic. For global/colonial identity, the Hong Kong Liberal Studies textbooks avoid the topic of British legacy but elaborate on the concept of 'world citizen'; in contrast, the Macau textbooks lack a clear-cut 'world citizen' identity but embrace the city's Portuguese/colonial legacy.

6 | EXPLAINING IDENTITY CONSTRUCTION: A MULTILEVEL STATE–SOCIETY INTERACTION

While not all factors leading to the production of textbooks can be disclosed through public archives, some factors can still be unravelled by analysing materials such as curriculum guidelines, education and government documents, and speeches by political figures. Based on these analyses, we argue that a framework of multilevel state–society interactions is especially helpful for demystifying the production process.

Civic textbooks in Hong Kong are very much a result of the interaction between the local SAR government and the local civil society. According to the Curriculum and Assessment Guide of Liberal Studies (Hong Kong) produced in 2007 and updated in 2015, the Guide was jointly prepared by the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (HKEAA) and the Curriculum Development Council (CDC), and the Council members include 'heads of schools, practising teachers, parents, employers, academics from tertiary institutions, professionals from related fields/bodies, representatives from the HKEAA and the Vocational Training Council (VTC), as well as officers from the EDB [referring to the Education Bureau]' (CDC & HKEAA, 2015, p. ii). If we regard the EDB (the Education Bureau) as an agency representing the local SAR government, then the CDC and its members can legitimately be viewed as representing the voices of Hong Kong's local (civil) society. In addition, the Guide also points out that

TABLE 2 Similarities and differences between Hong Kong and Macau textbooks.

	Local identity	National identity	Global identity	In sum
Hong Kong	Covers both civic and ethnic elements	Covers both civic and ethnic elements, but emphasises the impacts of events	Clear concept of 'world citizen'; avoidance of the British legacy	'Layered identities', eventful approach
Macau	Covers both civic and ethnic elements	Covers both civic and ethnic elements, but includes more ethnic elements	No clear concept of 'world citizen'; embracement of the Portuguese legacy	'Ambiguous identities', without the layered local–national–global structure

the process of developing the curriculum and assessment framework presented in this document has involved ongoing consultation with the various stakeholders, including education professionals and the general public. Their views have been taken into account, and there is now a consensus on the rationale and curriculum aims (CDC & HKEAA, 2015, p. 1)

Therefore, it is safe to argue that civic education textbooks, designed based on the Guide, are indeed the result of the interaction and co-operation between the local Hong Kong government and society, reflecting a 'consensus', as laid out in the Guide, in the then Hong Kong society. As a product of consensus, the Guide contends that its major goals include the development of positive values among students, including the promotion of 'national identity and commitment' (CDC & HKEAA, 2015, p. 5), and of students' 'independent learning' through an 'issue-enquiry approach' (CDC & HKEAA, 2015, p. 4). The 'issue-enquiry approach' strongly echoes the 'eventful' approach to national identity in the Hong Kong textbook.

Compared with Hong Kong, the textbook production in Macau mainly reflects the interaction between the local state and the central state. As mentioned in the data section, Macau's textbooks were co-designed by the Education and Youth Development Bureau of Macau and the PEP in China. While the production team and editors also 'consulted with local experts and teachers'¹³ in Macau, which partially reflects the voice of local society, the contents of the textbooks were directly designed and written by the Institute of Curriculum and Textbook Research of the PEP and 'guided' by Macau's Education and Youth Development Bureau,¹⁴ reflecting collaboration between the local state and the central state. According to its official website, the PEP, as of 2022, 'has researched, written, and published eleven sets of primary and secondary school textbooks in China and has undertaken the task of designing and publishing the textbooks of three subjects (*Morality and Rule of Law, Chinese, and History*)' (PEP, 2022). *Morality and Rule of Law* is the Chinese version of civic textbooks, and all three subjects mentioned above are strongly related to state ideology and national identity. The participation of the PEP in producing Macau's textbooks thus strongly explains the features of Macau's identity narratives in the textbooks, especially the more ethnic elements regarding national/Chinese identity. As Huang Qiang, the then PEP director, said, 'the textbooks aim to help students develop an accurate understanding of the nation, ethnicity, culture and history while acquiring knowledge',¹⁵ and the collaboration between Macau's education bureau and PEP 'has adhered to a high sense of responsibility and mission to nurture talents for the country'.¹⁶ Nevertheless, compared with the textbooks used in the Chinese mainland, the Macau textbooks indeed have more critical elements, such as the critique of local problems and the survey asking if one identifies himself/herself as Chinese (PEP, 2019a, p. 62). The mixture of 'patriotic' and critical elements in Macau's textbooks can thus be viewed as an example of the local state–central state interaction and co-operation.

The local state–central state relation, including the state's policy agenda, also explains Macau textbooks' favourable attitudes towards the city's colonial legacy. While the Chinese state is quite suspicious of the UK's role in Hong Kong, it fully embraces and actively promotes Macau's Portuguese legacy (Lam, 2010). One example is the Forum for Economic and Trade Co-operation between China and Portuguese-speaking Countries (Macao). This forum

was launched in October 2003. It resulted from an initiative by China's Central Government, in coordination with seven Portuguese-speaking countries—namely, Angola, Brazil, Cape Verde, Guinea-Bissau, Mozambique, Portugal and East Timor—and with the collaboration of the Government of the Macao Special Administrative Region (Macao SAR). (Matias Dos Santos, 2020; Tran & Matias Dos Santos, 2015)

As the textbook analysis shows, this forum is frequently mentioned in various volumes of *Morality and Citizenship*, which clearly illustrates the central state's policy agenda and the local state's embracement of the national political agenda.

In addition to the local state–society and the local state–central state relations, other interaction factors, such as the local–global relations, also affect textbook/discourse production. For instance, Hong Kong's and Macau's demographic and immigration policies, reflecting both the local state/society's concern and the local–global relation, strongly influence the two cities' identity narratives. As an international city, many Hong Kong residents come from foreign countries and are not ethnically Chinese. As the Aristo textbook states (see Page 207), in 2011, 6.8% of the Hong Kong population were foreign-born, coming from Indonesia, the Philippines, the UK, India, Pakistan, the United States, Australia, Nepal, Thailand, Japan and other regions. To incorporate these immigrants into local society, it is understandable that Hong Kong would emphasise a layered identity structure, incorporating local, national and global identities, including the concept of 'world citizen'. For the same reason, Hong Kong has also designed a clear-cut immigration policy, allowing anyone residing in the city for 7 years to become a permanent Hong Kong resident. In contrast, Macau is not an international financial centre with numerous global connections. As a much smaller economy, Macau relies heavily on the gambling industry and tourists from the Chinese mainland (Jeong, 2020), which partially explains why Macau has a rather ambiguous identity discourse without differentiating the local, national and global. Thus, compared with Hong Kong, Macau lacks a clear-cut 'world citizen' identity and, up to today, does not have a clearly defined immigration policy.

7 | CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

As former colonies and current SARs of China, Hong Kong and Macau went through decolonisation without becoming independent nation-states. Does this 'postcolonial territorial autonomy' status affect Hong Kong's and Macau's identity discourses? Are civic textbooks in the two cities instruments to promote the Chinese style of 'patriotic education' or tools to 'radicalise youth' in social movements? How does the study of Hong Kong and Macau contribute to our understanding of national identity and decolonisation in general?

Based on the analysis of *Hong Kong Today* and *Morality and Citizenship* as well as complementary materials such as curriculum guidelines and government documents, this paper argues that identity problems in postcolonial territorial autonomies, such as Hong Kong and Macau, can best be addressed by a framework of multilevel identities and state–society interactions. Specifically, we contend that the Hong Kong textbooks adopt a layered identity discourse, clearly differentiating the local, national and global identities, while the Macau textbooks adopt an ambiguous identity discourse. Moreover, although lacking a 'world citizen' identity, Macau has a rather favourable attitude towards its Portuguese legacy, which sharply contrasts with Hong Kong's avoidance of its British legacy. Hong Kong's and Macau's different identity discourses can be explained by the textbook production processes in the two cities, which are the results of the local state–society interactions and the local state–central state relations.

This research dialogues with and challenges many assumptions on the role of school education in forming national identities, especially in the context of the Greater China area. First, while China's 'patriotic education' projects are powerfully conducted in the Chinese mainland, the Hong Kong and Macau governments only adopt a 'mild' version of this education. Although 'securitisation' of education (Vickers & Morris, 2022) has always been on Hong Kong's and Macau's policy agendas, the civic textbooks in the two cities did not abandon critical thinking either. Meanwhile, while the Hong Kong discourse emphasises cultural and ethnic elements (Jackson, 2019), our research finds that the Macau textbooks utilise more ethnic content when narrating national identity, partially echoing the Mainland-style of patriotic education. However, saying that Hong Kong and Macau textbooks are 'mild' in terms of Mainland-style 'patriotic education' does not mean the two cities are promoting anti-state elements. In fact, one common 'learning objective' in Hong Kong and Macau textbooks is to nurture 'national identity', which is clearly laid out in Hong Kong's curriculum guideline and mentioned several times in Macau's textbooks. In this sense, the argument that civic education (in Hong Kong) is 'radicalising youth' seems to be an exaggeration.

Second, our research also challenges the argument that Hong Kong's civic education is not sufficiently 'decolonised', which could contribute to the British nostalgia and a lack of national identity in the city. As our textual and

content analyses show, the Hong Kong Liberal Studies textbooks intentionally avoid the topic of British/colonial legacy; in the few paragraphs mentioning the UK, the Hong Kong textbooks also criticise the UK for the negative influence of its colonial rule. In contrast, Macau, as a more patriotic city and China's 'good child', actually holds a much more favourable attitude towards Portugal and its colonial legacy. Based on these findings, one may argue that the 'lack of decolonisation' thesis seems to be inaccurate.

In addition to civic education, however, there exist other educational efforts, such as the subjects of Chinese History and CSD (as replacement of Hong Kong's Liberal Studies since 2021), that strongly affect the construction of national identity. Although Chinese History is not a compulsory subject in Hong Kong, it inevitably influences students' national identity and their views of China (see Kan, 2010; Vickers & Kan, 2003). Meanwhile, compared with the traditional Liberal Studies, which was conducted in a more open manner, the new CSD curriculum is put under more rigorous scrutiny by the education bureau in Hong Kong. In the CSD curriculum, for instance, the *Hong Kong Today* textbook is redesigned and renamed as *Hong Kong under One Country Two Systems*, and the discussion of local identities is substantially reduced or deleted (see Yim, 2022). Despite their importance, the subjects of Chinese History and CSD textbooks are not the focus of this study and deserve examinations in separate articles.

Last but not least, using Hong Kong and Macau as representative 'postcolonial territorial autonomies', this article contributes to the general theories on national identity and decolonisation. Building upon the literature treating identity as multifaceted, heterogeneous and fluid (Bonikowski, 2017; Ku, 2018; Ou & Sandel, 2021), this study not only resists an essentialist and reified understanding of national identity but also illustrates the necessity of studying national identity *in relation to* other types of identities. Without understanding Hong Kong's and Macau's *relations to* the UK, Portugal and China, for instance, one can hardly understand why the Hong Kong textbooks adopt a layered identity discourse, whereas Macau blurs the boundary between the local, national and global identities. While this relational understanding of national identity is most evident in 'postcolonial territorial autonomies', it also helps us understand other types of national identities—Chinese nationalism, for instance, cannot be fully apprehended without studying the Sino-Japan relations.

Admittedly, examining Hong Kong's and Macau's identities through a 'colonial–Chinese–global nexus', using Agnes Ku's (2018) term, is not new. However, as Ku points out in the same article, 'the logic of each dimension and the potentially tense relationships within and among them remain unclear and have yet to unfold' (Ku, 2018). Using a multilevel framework of state–society interactions, this article is an effort to disclose the interaction logic of these dimensions, demystifying identity *production* processes. Why do Hong Kong and Macau, both 'postcolonial territorial autonomies', adopt different (national) identity discourses in their textbooks? The answer depends on which interaction mode dominates in the city: Is it a local-level state–society interaction, an interaction between local and national states or an interaction beyond the local and the national?

This study also contributes to a rethinking of decolonisation. What counts as 'postcolonial' or 'decolonised'? Why would some regard Hong Kong's textbooks as a 'lack of decolonisation' and treat Macau's education as 'patriotic' despite its embracement of colonial legacy? Echoing the call to study postcolonial theory as analyses of 'discursive, ideological, and epistemic processes' (Go, 2017), this study argues that the production of colonial symbols, icons and meanings can and will be transformed in relation to the local and national identities, often as results of the state–society interactions at multiple levels. For instance, the São Paulo façade, clearly a colonial symbol, is now viewed as an icon of Macau, incorporated into the city's local identity. The Bund (*Waitan*) in Shanghai, a centre of foreign establishment and a colonial mark, has now become the symbol of a modernised Shanghai or China. While this kind of meaning transformation is not necessarily accepted by the public, this article discloses the production logic of identity transformation, sometimes quite arbitrary and political, thus refuting a reified understanding of decolonisation.

In sum, by studying Hong Kong and Macau as examples of 'postcolonial territorial autonomy' and by proposing a multilevel framework of identity and state–society interactions, this article contributes both empirical and theoretical knowledge to the studies of national identity and decolonisation. Hong Kong's layered identity discourse and avoidance of the British legacy and Macau's ambiguous identity discourse and embracement of the Portuguese

legacy illustrate the necessity of a relational and interactional understanding of national identity. It also challenges the myths regarding Hong Kong's 'problematic' Liberal Studies and Macau's 'patriotic' education. With the ongoing development of the issue, however, many themes, such as racial exclusion in identity discourses (Jackson, 2019) and the narratives in Hong Kong's newly produced CSD curriculum, deserve more studies in the future.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Previous versions of this paper were presented in the International Workshop on 'Rethinking the Gambling City: Challenges in Macau History' and the 2022 Annual Conference of Macau Studies. We thank the participants of these conferences for their comments and suggestions. We would also like to thank the editors and the anonymous reviewers for their valuable suggestions.

ORCID

Meng U leong  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5551-2252>

ENDNOTES

- ¹ Although Naftali points out that the statist/top-down feature of Chinese nationalism is different from 'ethnically based nationalist aspirations elsewhere in the world' (Naftali, 2021), Naftali also recognises the importance of ethnic elements, such as the Han traditions and cultures, in constructing Chinese identity.
- ² See <https://www.scmp.com/news/hong-kong/politics/article/3111740/hong-kong-high-school-course-vexes-beijing-headed-makeover>. Accessed 6 August 2022.
- ³ See <https://www.scmp.com/news/hong-kong/politics/article/3111740/hong-kong-high-school-course-vexes-beijing-headed-makeover>. Accessed 6 August 2022.
- ⁴ Atsuko Ichijo (2022) differentiates three types of territorial autonomies (TAs): one arising from intra-state politics (such as Quebec), one from interstate politics (such as Hong Kong and Macao) and one from decolonisation (such as Guam). While we agree with the value of this typology, we use the term 'postcolonial territorial autonomies' not to study how particular TAs were born but to emphasise the indispensable roles of colonial pasts for 'postcolonial' autonomies' current identities.
- ⁵ <https://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1163630.shtml>. Accessed 13 October 2022.
- ⁶ The civic conception refers to the identification with legal procedures and civic cultures (such as the rule of law), while the ethnic conception refers to the ethnic descent and cultural ties bonding the community.
- ⁷ See <https://ls.edb.hkcity.net/en/overview.php>. Accessed 11 August 2022.
- ⁸ While there is no official data on the recent market share of these different textbooks, the Aristo and HKEP textbooks are usually viewed as the most frequently used versions. This observation is corroborated by the authors' inquiries at several bookstores in Hong Kong.
- ⁹ See <http://news.wenweipo.com/2020/05/28/IN2005280004.htm>. Accessed 14 October 2022.
- ¹⁰ The traditional Liberal Studies textbooks in Hong Kong were not required to go through the official/political screening, though they still followed the Liberal Studies Curriculum and Assessment Guide; the schools and teachers were allowed to choose different Liberal Studies texts for use. However, after the 2019 movement, the Hong Kong authority began to invite publishers, including Aristo and HKEP, to voluntarily submit their textbooks for 'professional consultation' (see <https://www.bbc.com/zhongwen/trad/chinese-news-53846482>; accessed 12 April 2023). After being renamed as Citizenship and Social Development in 2021, the civic textbooks are now required to undergo official screening.
- ¹¹ 'Macanese' refers to residents with Portuguese ancestry and identity but born and raised in Macau.
- ¹² While the term 'incident' [*shijian*] has different connotations in different (language) contexts, the phrase 'June 4 incident' [*shijian*] is widely used by the Chinese-speaking communities, including reputable news agencies such as BBC Chinese. The Chinese government's official term for 'June 4' is 'disturbance' or 'turmoil' [*fengbo*]. This article directly adopts the term 'June 4 incident [*shijian*]' to faithfully reflect the original wording of the textbooks.
- ¹³ <http://edu.people.com.cn/BIG5/n1/2020/0930/c1006-31881573.html>. Accessed 19 November 2022.
- ¹⁴ <http://edu.people.com.cn/BIG5/n1/2020/0930/c1006-31881573.html>. Accessed 19 November 2022.
- ¹⁵ <https://www.macaupostdaily.com/article9411.html>. Accessed 19 November 2022.
- ¹⁶ <http://edu.people.com.cn/BIG5/n1/2020/0930/c1006-31881573.html>. Accessed 19 November 2022.

REFERENCES

- Bonikowski, B. (2017). Nationhood as cultural repertoire: Collective identities and political attitudes in France and Germany. In *Everyday nationhood: Theorising culture, identity and belonging after banal nationalism* (pp. 147–174). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Bray, M. (1992). Colonialism, scale, and politics: Divergence and convergence of educational development in Hong Kong and Macau. *Comparative Education Review*, 36(3), 322–342.
- Brubaker, R. (1990). Immigration, citizenship, and the nation-state in France and Germany: A comparative historical analysis. *International Sociology*, 5(4), 379–407. <https://doi.org/10.1177/026858090005004003>
- Brubaker, R. (1992). *Citizenship and nationhood in France and Germany*. Harvard University Press.
- Carroll, J. (2007). *A concise history of Hong Kong*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Clayton, C. H. (2009). *Sovereignty at the edge: Macau and the question of Chineseness*. Harvard University Asia Center.
- Curriculum Development Council & Hong Kong Examination and Assessment Authority (CDC & HKEAA). (2015). *Liberal studies curriculum and assessment guide (secondary 4–6)*. https://ls.edb.hkedcity.net/file/C_and_A_guide/201511/LS_CAGuide_e_2015.pdf (Accessed 19 August 2022).
- Curriculum Development Council & Hong Kong Examination and Assessment Authority (CDC & HKEAA). (2021). *Citizenship and Social Development curriculum and assessment guide (secondary 4–6)*. https://ls.edb.hkedcity.net/file/C_and_A_guide/202106/CS_CAG_S4-6_Eng_2021.pdf (Accessed 25 January 2023).
- Diç, P. (2020). The content of school textbooks in (nation) states and “stateless autonomies”: A comparison of Turkey and the Autonomous Administration of North and East Syria (Rojava). *Nations and Nationalism*, 26(4), 994–1014.
- Fong, B. C., & Ichijo, A. (Eds.). (2022). *The Routledge handbook of comparative territorial autonomies* (Vol. 1). Routledge.
- Go, J. (2017). Postcolonial thought as social theory. In C. E. Benzecry, M. Krause, & I. A. Reed (Eds.), *Social theory now* (pp. 130–161). University of Chicago Press.
- Gries, P. H. (2005). Chinese nationalism: Challenging the state? *Current History*, 104(683), 251–256.
- Guichard, S. (2013). The Indian nation and selective amnesia: Representing conflicts and violence in Indian history textbooks. *Nations and Nationalism*, 19(1), 68–86.
- Hao, Z. (2011). *Macau history and society*. Hong Kong University Press.
- Hook, B., & Neves, M. S. (2002). The role of Hong Kong and Macau in China's relations with Europe. *The China Quarterly*, 169, 108–135.
- Hung, C. L., Chow, K. K., & Hui, T. M. H. (2017). *Hong Kong today*. Hong Kong Educational Publishing Company.
- Ichijo, A. (2022). What are territorial autonomies and why the handbook. In B. C. H. Fong & A. Ichijo (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of comparative territorial autonomies* (pp. 3–14). Routledge.
- leong, M. U. (2017). Macao and Hong Kong—Convergence or divergence? The 2014 Anti-Retirement Package Bill Protest and Macao's governance crisis. *Asian Survey*, 57(3), 504–527.
- leong, M. U. (2019). Attitudes towards the Umbrella Movement in Macao: Findings and implications from a survey of university students. *China: An International Journal*, 17(2), 181–195.
- leong, M. U. (2020). Introduction. In M. U. leong (Ed.), *Macau 20 years after the handover: Changes and challenges under “one country, two systems”* (pp. 1–8). Routledge.
- Jackson, L. (2019). Relations of blood? Racialization of civic identity in twenty-first century Hong Kong. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 40(6), 761–772.
- Kan, F. L. (2010). The functions of Hong Kong's Chinese history, from colonialism to decolonization. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 42(2), 263–278.
- Ku, A. S. M. (2018). Identity as politics: Contesting the local, the national and the global. In *Routledge handbook of contemporary Hong Kong* (pp. 451–461). Routledge.
- Kumar, K. (2003). *The making of English national identity*. Cambridge University Press.
- Lam, W.-M. (2010). Promoting hybridity: The politics of the new Macau identity. *The China Quarterly*, 203, 656–674. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0305741010000640>
- Lu, Z. (2017). The changing definition of China in middle school history textbooks. *Nations and Nationalism*, 23(3), 571–598.
- Matias Dos Santos, J. C. (2020). Macau and China-Portuguese speaking countries relations: From national branding to soft power. In M. U. leong (Ed.), *Macau 20 years after the handover: Changes and challenges under “one country, two systems”* (pp. 36–54). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429323157-5>
- Morris, P., & Vickers, E. (2015). Schooling, politics and the construction of identity in Hong Kong: The 2012 ‘Moral and National Education’ crisis in historical context. *Comparative Education*, 51(3), 305–326.
- Naftali, O. (2021). “Being Chinese means becoming cheap labour”: Education, national belonging and social positionality among youth in contemporary China. *The China Quarterly*, 245, 51–71.
- Ng, L. F., Wong, M. L., & Wong, T. C. (2016). *Hong Kong today*. Aristo.
- Ou, C., & Sandel, T. L. (2021). Unified or divided “we-hood”: Discursive constructions of heterogeneous national identities under the one country, two systems model. *Chinese Journal of Communication*, 14(3), 329–345.

- People's Education Press (PEP). (2019a). *Morality and citizenship, middle school, grade 1*. People's Education Press.
- People's Education Press (PEP). (2019b). *Morality and citizenship, middle school, grade 2*. People's Education Press.
- People's Education Press (PEP). (2019c). *Morality and citizenship, middle school, grade 3*. People's Education Press.
- People's Education Press (PEP). (2019d). *Morality and citizenship, high school, grade 1*. People's Education Press.
- People's Education Press (PEP). (2019e). *Morality and citizenship, high school, grade 2*. People's Education Press.
- People's Education Press (PEP). (2019f). *Morality and citizenship, high school, grade 3*. People's Education Press.
- People's Education Press (PEP). (2022). *People's Education Press (autumn) recruitment announcement*. https://www.pep.com.cn/rjdt/jqgg/202210/t20221008_1980350.shtml. (Accessed 14 October 2022).
- Perry, E. (1994). Trends in the study of Chinese politics: State-society relations. *China Quarterly*, 139, 704–713.
- Pina-Cabral, J. d. (2002). *Between China and Europe: Person, culture and emotion in Macao*. London School of Economics Monographs on Social Anthropology.
- Qian, L., Xu, B., & Chen, D. (2017). Does history education promote nationalism in China? A 'limited effect' explanation. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 26(104), 199–212.
- Ram, H. (2000). The immemorial Iranian nation? School textbooks and historical memory in post-revolutionary Iran. *Nations and Nationalism*, 6(1), 67–90.
- Reeskens, T., & Hooghe, M. (2010). Beyond the civic-ethnic dichotomy: Investigating the structure of citizenship concepts across thirty-three countries. *Nations and Nationalism*, 16(4), 579–597.
- Smith, A. (1992). National identity and the idea of European unity. *International Affairs*, 68(1), 55–76.
- Tang, W., & Darr, B. (2012). Chinese nationalism and its political and social origins. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 21(77), 811–826.
- Tran, É., & Matias Dos Santos, J. C. (2015). The seminars of the Macao forum: An illustration of China's soft-power diplomacy towards the Portuguese-speaking countries. *China: an International Journal*, 13(1), 93–112. <https://doi.org/10.1353/chn.2015.0006>
- Trošt, P. (2018). Ruptures and continuities in nationhood narratives: Reconstructing the nation through history textbooks in Serbia and Croatia. *Nations and Nationalism*, 24(3), 716–740.
- Vickers, E., & Kan, F. (2003). The reeducation of Hong Kong: Identity, politics and education in postcolonial Hong Kong. *American Asian Review*, 21(4), 179–228.
- Vickers, E., & Morris, P. (2022). Accelerating Hong Kong's reeducation: 'Mainlandisation', securitisation and the 2020 National Security Law. *Comparative Education*, 58(2), 187–205.
- Wang, Z. (2014). *Never forget national humiliation: Historical memory in Chinese politics and foreign relations*. Columbia University Press.
- Washington, G., Lincoln, A., & Hutchins, R. D. (2011). Contestation and negotiation: Regionalism and the politics of school textbooks in Ukraine's eastern borderlands. *Nations and Nationalism*, 17(3), 649–668.
- Yim, C. (2022). *Hong Kong under one country two systems*. Aristo.
- Zhao, S. (1998). A state-led nationalism: The patriotic education campaign in post-Tiananmen China. *Communist and Post-Communist Studies*, 31(3), 287–302.
- Zhou, Y., & Lam, S. M. (2022). Prioritizing education: The Macao experience since the Millennium. In W. O. Lee, P. Brown, A. L. Goodwin, & A. Green (Eds.), *International handbook on education development in Asia-Pacific*. Springer.

How to cite this article: Qian, L., & leong, M. U. (2023). Debating national identity in postcolonial cities: A comparison of civic education textbooks in Hong Kong and Macau. *Nations and Nationalism*, 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.1111/nana.12974>